

(v. 2) Module 4.c - Compare two keywords

Survey Flow

ReferenceSurvey: (Ref. Survey) Info about this exercise
Block: WHAT THIS MODULE DOES (1 Question) Standard: IDENTIFY TWO WORDS TO COMPARE (3 Questions)
ReferenceSurvey: (Ref. block for Module 4c) Module 3c - Analyze keyword 1 ReferenceSurvey: (Ref. block for Module 4c) Module 3c - Analyze keyword 2
Standard: COMPARE OBSERVATIONS ON WORDS 1 AND 2 (8 Questions)
ReferenceSurvey: Ref. Survey Research Takeaways ReferenceSurvey: (Ref. Survey) Survey end

Page Break

IS THIS A TRIAL? Before you begin, please check the choice below if this is just a trial or experimental exercise that should be ignored in collecting outputs from this module.

Trial surveys do not have to be completed. (However, you have to rush through them with empty answers all the way to the finish to clear them from the system. Otherwise, next time you open the same survey, Qualtrics will put you back where you were in the same survey.)

Actual surveys should be completed within one week, after which they will be automatically recorded as finished.

Check this field if this is just a trial: (1)

OPEN RESEARCH POLICY

Statement of open research policy

The modules of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol create records of research that support the project's aim of advancing "open, generalizable, and replicable digital humanities methodology" (see project ["About"](#) statement). This aim is related to current practices of ["open science"](#) and ["open-notebook science."](#) The basic idea is that the materials, methods, steps, and findings of research should be transparent so that other researchers know how conclusions were reached and can test or reproduce the process--an ideal that is especially needed for understanding such machine-learning methods as topic modeling (see [WE1S bibliography on machine-learning interpretability](#)).

In completing this and other modules of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol you are creating an "open notebook" that in principle can be shared with others as a public record of research. *Please be sure that all descriptions, observations, and notes you write in this module are consistent with being part of public record--that is, appropriate in tone, respectful to others, and not in violation of privacy or copyright restrictions.*

However please also do not let the ideal of open-notebook science inhibit you from speculative or tentative in-progress commentary. It is understood that research, open or otherwise, is a *process* of finding knowledge with many stages and levels of confidence. (At the conclusion of this and other modules of the Interpretation Protocol, you will be asked to rate your confidence level in the current exercise.)

In addition, lab notebooks are allowed to be messy as a part of the research process. It is not

expected that notes written into these modules be copyedited as if for formal publication. (The time for polishing is later when writing up a report synthesizing results from one or more modules of this Interpretation Protocol.)

EXERCISE INFO Please enter the following the following information, which will generate an "Exercise ID".

Team names and members can be looked up on the [Team Dashboard](#). (Note: at the end of this survey, you can also enter an email address if you wish to receive a copy of the survey with your answers.)

Your name or team name. (If team, then use the format "Team1", "Team2", etc. Please do not use a space): (1) _____

Interpretation project number (e.g., "4," indicating that this is the fourth interpretation project for you or your team that the exercise with this module is part of): (2) _____

Which stage of your present interpretation project does this module represent? (E.g., if this module is the second you have used in the sequence of modules for the same interpretation project, then write the number "2" here. If multiple team members are working in parallel using various modules, then follow the convention of adding name-abbreviation letters for each member's stage--e.g., "2AL" (for Alan Liu), "2LT" (for Lindsay Thomas), etc. . (3) _____

Today's date in the format YYYY-MM-DD (e.g., 2019-07-06) (4) _____

The **present** Interpretation Protocol module you are using (e.g., 1, 2, 3a, 4a, etc.) --This is needed to generate an exercise ID. For example, if this is Module 3a, then enter 3a (5) _____

G DRIVE INFO Your team folder in the project Google team working space.

The shared WE1S working space for AM teams in summer 2019 for storing notes, reports, materials, etc. related to interpretation work is in this [Google Drive folder](#). Go there to find the subfolder your team created for your work and enter its URL here.

Please enter below the URL for your team's subfolder in the common AM Teams workspace:

Page Break



EXERCISE ID Exercise ID

The ID for the present exercise (generated from the information you just provided) is as follows. (Do not change. If you see a mistake, please go "back" in this survey and correct the information that generated the Exercise ID.)

EXERCISE DESCRIP Exercise Description

To assist in remembering what the exercise using this module is about, please enter below a very brief description of what you are currently doing (e.g., "We are now going to compare the keywords 'humanities' and 'sciences' in the 20190621_2132_us-humanities-top-newspapers---topics200 model.")

TOPIC MODEL **Topic model you are studying**

For the topic model you are studying, please enter below its "**topic model name**" and "**start page**" URL. A "**topic model name**" looks like this: "20190621_2132_us-humanities-top-newspapers---topics200". You can locate this name in the [Registry of WE1S Topic Models](#).

Note that this is the name of the specific granularity of the model you are studying (number of topics). The "**start page**" is the URL of the overall topic model (including all its granularities and their visualizations) listed on this page on the Harbor 10002 server: [Index of / projects/](#). (You can also find this URL in the Registry of WE1S Topic Models.)

A start page URL looks like this: http://harbor.english.ucsb.edu:10002/projects/20190621_2132_us-humanities-top-newspapers/

"Topic model name" (1) _____

"Start page" URL (2) _____

RESEARCH QUESTION **Research question you are addressing**

Please enter below information about the research question you are addressing in this exercise. You can find this information in the "Registry of WE1S Research Questions." (If you are taking an overview of a model prior to working on a specific research question, just enter "Taking an overview")

Research question (1) _____

Operationalized form of question (2)

Research question ID (use the format "team2-q1", representing in this example team 2's first research question): (4) _____

PREVIOUS MODULES Previous Interpretation Protocol modules you used to address your research question (if any)

Enter in sequence below any Interpretation Protocol modules you have already completed in previous steps of your current interpretation project. For example, if for steps 1-3 preceding this exercise (where the current exercise is now step 4 in the sequence) you previously used modules 3a, 3b, and 3c in that order, then enter those module numbers in that sequence.

- Step 1 - Module used (1) _____
- Step 2 - Module used (2) _____
- Step 3 - Module used (3) _____
- Step 4 - Module used (4) _____
- Step 5 - Module used (5) _____
- Step 6 - Module used (6) _____
- Step 7 - Module used (7) _____
- Step 8 - Module used (8) _____
- Step 9 - Module used (9) _____
- Step 10 - Module used (10) _____

Page Break _____

R1: exercise info

Reminders - Info about this Exercise: **Your name or team name:** [\\${EXERCISE INFO/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1}](#) **[\\${G DRIVE INFO/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#)**
target="_blank">Link to your team's folder on the WE1S project Google team drive.

Exercise ID: [\\${EXERCISE ID/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Exercise**
Description: [\\${EXERCISE DESCRIP/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Topic model name:**
[\\${TOPIC MODEL/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1}](#) [\\${TOPIC MODEL/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2}](#)"
target="_blank">Start page of model **Research question (and**
ID): [\\${RESEARCH QUESTION/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1}](#) (research question ID #[\\${RESEARCH QUESTION/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4}](#))
Operationalized form of question: [\\${RESEARCH QUESTION/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2}](#)
Previous sequence of interpretation modules used for this question (if any): [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9}](#), [\\${PREVIOUS MODULES/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10}](#)

End of Block: INFO ABOUT YOU & EXERCISE (v. 2, created 9 June 2019, rev. 7 July 2019)

Start of Block: WHAT THIS MODULE DOES

MODULE PURPOSE

What module 4.c does

(Module 4.c, v. 2, created 22 June 2019; last rev. 13 July 2019.)

The purpose of module 4.c of the WE1S topic model Interpretation Protocol is to examine two words in relation to each other in a model (e.g., "humanities" and "science"). Individual words are approximate proxies for concepts or contexts that you are investigating for particular research question--e.g., "what kinds of topics are the words 'humanities' and 'science' prominent in?" This module builds on top of Module 3.c ("Analyze a keyword"), which helps refine your understanding of a single word in a topic model (and the concept or context it represents). Module 4.c leads you through a structured process of comparing the results of running truncated versions of Module 3.c on two different keywords.

End of Block: WHAT THIS MODULE DOES

Start of Block: IDENTIFY TWO WORDS TO COMPARE

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

STEP 1 Step 1: Identify the two words you wish to compare

Enter here the two words in which you are interested (single word only; no punctuation except underscores used in such "wikified" named entities in the WE1S corpus beginning with "wiki_"). For reference, we will call these **word1** and **word2**.

In addressing some research questions, you will already know which words you want to compare (e.g., if your research questions is about how newspapers talk about "humanities" and "science" together). However, for other research questions you may be using this Interpretation Protocol module to test the relation between words to see what combination best allows you to address your question. In the latter case, a best practice is to use the function in the TopicBubbles visualization interface that allows you to search for which topics two (or more) words are both prominent in. See the screenshot below for instructions (and the *TMO Guide*, [chapter 3](#), section 4.c, for a more detailed explanation).

	(one-word only)	
	Keyword 1 (1)	Keyword 2 (2)
The two keywords you wish to compare: (4)		

LAUNCH STEPS 2 & 3 Steps 2 and 3 (repeated uses of Module 3.c for each keyword)

When you press "Save and Next" below, you will be asked to go through two separate repetitions of a truncated version of Module 3.c ("Analyze a keyword")--one for each of your words. When you have completed these, you will be returned to the present Module 4.c to compare your observations on the words.

End of Block: IDENTIFY TWO WORDS TO COMPARE

Start of Block: START WORD 1 ANALYSIS



STEP 1 Step 1: Reenter Word 1

Please reenter the first word you are studying:

End of Block: START WORD 1 ANALYSIS

Start of Block: FIND TOPICS IN WHICH WORD 1 IS PROMINENT

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#)

STEP 2 Step 2. Find topics in which word 1 is prominent.

Find the highest weight topics in which the keyword you are interested in is important (*but omit any "super-topics" as defined in Module 2; reminder below*). This can be done in several different ways using the general-purpose visualization interfaces in the WE1S Topic Model Observatory as instructed below. (For additional instructions on these tools, see the [TMO Guide](#)).

* **Dfr-browser:** Under the "Word Index" tab in Dfr-browser, click on the word you are studying to see a visualization of "prominent topics for [word]". See which topics the word is prominent in, where "prominent" means that the word shows up among the most frequent words in that topic.

**Screenshot 1:Dfr-browser "word index" view
"prominent topics for [a word]" view**

Screenshot 2: Dfr-browser

* **TopicBubbles:** Search for a word in TopicBubbles and see which larger topics the word shows up in and the relative importance of the word in that topic.

Screenshot: TopicBubbles - search for a word function

* **pyLDAvis:** In pyLDAvis, find a topic in which the word you are interested appears in the right-hand panel for "top-30 most salient terms." Then click on the word to see in the left-hand panel what large topics the word show up in. *(You can also adjust the λ "lambda" metric for relevance of terms to a topic to fine-tune your sense of the relation of a word to a topic. The creators of this tool found in one test with a topic model that $\lambda = 0.6$ gave optimal results. See [Sievert and Shirley.](#))*

Screenshot 1: pyLDAvis - click on a word to see which topics it is prominent in

Screenshot 2: pyLDAvis - adjust λ (lambda) relevance metric

IDENTIFY TOPICS Identify some topics of interest in which the word you are studying is prominent: Below, identify by their topic numbers up to 10 topics of interest bearing on your research question that your word is prominent in. Also label the topics if you can (a label should be a word or short phrase representing only the objective part of your observation, or what the topic is "about". It should not be formed as a sentence, which tends to posit a thesis.)

(If you have more than 10 topics of interest, then record them in notes in your "observation" commentary later in this exercise.)

Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent	
Topic # (1)	Label (1)

(1)		
(2)		
(3)		
(4)		
(5)		
(6)		
(7)		
(8)		
(9)		
(10)		

End of Block: FIND TOPICS IN WHICH WORD 1 IS PROMINENT

Start of Block: EXAMINE THE TOPICS YOU IDENTIFIED FOR WORD 1

R exercise info $\{R1: \text{exercise info/QuestionText}\}$

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: $\{\text{STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}\}$ **Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent:** $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$

$\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}\}$

STEP 3 Step 3: Examine the topics associated with word 1 that you have identified

Use the general-purpose interfaces in the Topic Model Observatory (Dfr-browser, TopicBubbles, and pyLDAvis) to examine the topics associated with your work that you have identified. For example, Look at other top words in those topics. (*Remember that in pyLDAvis you can adjust the λ lambda metric for relevance of top words to a topic.*) Look quickly at some of the documents most associated with those topics, and read a few of the documents. You can also use the special purpose interfaces in the Topic Model Observatory to see other aspects of the topics. For example, See how topics are associated with particular publication sources or whole sets of such sources See how two topics compare to each other in their relation

to publication sources See whether the topics are part of topic-clusters As you learn about your word in the context of the topics you have identified, start the running note below by making any observations that bear on your research question or are otherwise of interest.



RUNNING NOTE 1 **Start a running note for Word 1:**

End of Block: EXAMINE THE TOPICS YOU IDENTIFIED FOR WORD 1

Start of Block: EXAMINE RELATED TOPICS FOR WORD 1

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent:** [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}

STEP 4 Step 4. Find and examine topics "related" through their top words to the topics you examined above

(1) First, if any of the topics you previously examined are in clusters with other topics, examine some of those other topics.

(2) Second, examine some topics whose top words are similar to those of one or more of the topics you earlier examined. "Similar" means: Suppose that in a topic you earlier examined the top five words are "cat, dog, horse, cow, chicken." Then find topics whose top five words include **one** or **two** of "cat, dog, horse, cow, chicken." Identify below up to 5 such related topics and try to label them:

Related topics		
	Topic # (1)	Label (1)

(1)		
(5)		
(6)		
(7)		
(8)		

Page Break _____

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} **Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent:** \${IDENTIFY

- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}



RUNNING NOTE 2 Now examine the related topics you identified above and add anything of interest to your running note:

End of Block: EXAMINE RELATED TOPICS FOR WORD 1

Start of Block: ARE THERE RELATED WORDS?

reminders.block7 \${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} **Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent:** \${IDENTIFY}

TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

STEP 5 Step 5: Identify related words.

Having looked at your word, did you notice any related words in the topic model of the following kinds? words that are conceptually related to the keyword you just examined (e.g., terms that you might want to examine to continue investigating your research question) words morphologically related to the keyword you just examined (e.g., "sciences" if your just-examined word was "science") that might be looked at more closely to determine if they should or should not be consolidated in the topic model to be the same word ("token") As due diligence, you may also want to use the *Historical Thesaurus of the Oxford English Dictionary (HTOED)* to look around the taxonomic neighborhood of your word for any obvious related words in the English language that you haven't noticed so far. Looking for such words in your topic model will often lead to the same topics you have already considered, but it may also lead down new avenues of exploration. (The *HTOED* provides a systematic taxonomic and chronological view of words categorized by related meanings. It is accessed through a link on the main *OED* page available through your university library's institutional subscription.)

(a) (b)

Screenshot A: Link to the *HTOED* on the *OED* site.

Screenshot B: example from the *HTOED* (taxonomic neighborhood of the word "value" and synonyms in the historical order they entered the language).

If you find related words of interest, please enter them below:

CONCEPTUALLY RELATED **Conceptually related words:**

- (1) _____
 - (2) _____
 - (3) _____
 - (4) _____
 - (5) _____
-

MORPHOLOGICAL RELATED **Morphologically related words:**

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____
- (4) _____
- (5) _____

End of Block: ARE THERE RELATED WORDS?

Start of Block: SUMMARY OBSERVATIONS

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Topics of interest in**

which word 1 is prominent: [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

Related words you noticed: **Conceptually related words:** \${CONCEPTUALLY
RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry} **Morphologically related**
words: \${MORPHOLOGICL RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry}



STEP 6 Step 6. Summary observation on word 1

Please write a brief summary observation on the word 1 you studied that bears on your research question (or explain why looking at the word does not allow you to advance on the question). Feel free to draw on, revise, or extend your running notes for this purpose.

An “observation” should have two parts: a more-or-less objective description in which you have high confidence; and a thesis, hypothesis, interpretation, or suggestion for which you have less confidence before you study the model more closely but that might bear on your research question.

Page Break



GO TO NEXT REF BLOCK To go to the next part of this exercise (examining your word 2), please press "Next"

(The following text box simply captures the summary observation you just made so that we can carry it forward to a different part of the survey. Ignore it, unless you want to revise it.)

End of Block: SUMMARY OBSERVATIONS

Start of Block: START WORD 2 ANALYSIS



STEP 1 Step 1: Reenter Word 2

Please reenter the first word you are studying:

End of Block: START WORD 2 ANALYSIS

Start of Block: FIND TOPICS IN WHICH WORD 2 IS PROMINENT

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#)

STEP 2 Step 2. Find topics in which word 2 is prominent.

Find the highest weight topics in which the keyword you are interested in is important (*but omit any "super-topics" as defined in Module 2; reminder below*). This can be done in several different ways using the general-purpose visualization interfaces in the WE1S Topic Model Observatory as instructed below. (For additional instructions on these tools, see the [TMO Guide](#)).

* **Dfr-browser:** Under the "Word Index" tab in Dfr-browser, click on the word you are studying to see a visualization of "prominent topics for [word]". See which topics the word is prominent in, where "prominent" means that the word shows up among the most frequent words in that topic.

Screenshot 1:Dfr-browser "word index" view
"prominent topics for [a word]" view

Screenshot 2: Dfr-browser

* **TopicBubbles:** Search for a word in TopicBubbles and see which larger topics the word shows up in and the relative importance of the word in that topic.

Screenshot: TopicBubbles - search for a word function

* **pyLDAvis:** In pyLDAvis, find a topic in which the word you are interested appears in the right-hand panel for "top-30 most salient terms." Then click on the word to see in the left-hand panel what large topics the word show up in. (*You can also adjust the λ "lambda" metric for relevance of terms to a topic to fine-tune your sense of the relation of a word to a topic. The creators of this tool found in one test with a topic model that $\lambda = 0.6$ gave optimal results. See [Sievert and Shirley.](#))*

Screenshot 1: pyLDAvis - click on a word to see which topics it is prominent in
Screenshot 2: pyLDAvis - adjust λ (lambda) relevance metric

IDENTIFY TOPICS Identify some topics of interest in which the word you are studying is prominent: Below, identify by their topic numbers up to 10 topics of interest bearing on your research question that your word is prominent in. Also label the topics if you can (a label should be a word or short phrase representing only the objective part of your observation, or what the topic is "about". It should not be formed as a sentence, which tends to posit a thesis.)

(If you have more than 10 topics of interest, then record them in notes in your "observation" commentary later in this exercise.)

	Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent	
	Topic # (1)	Label (1)

(1)		
(2)		
(3)		
(4)		
(5)		
(6)		
(7)		
(8)		
(9)		
(10)		

End of Block: FIND TOPICS IN WHICH WORD 2 IS PROMINENT

Start of Block: EXAMINE THE TOPICS YOU IDENTIFIED FOR WORD 2

R exercise info $\{R1: \text{exercise info/QuestionText}\}$

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: $\{\text{STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}\}$ **Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent:** $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$

$\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}\}$ $\{\text{IDENTIFY}$
 $\text{TOPICS\%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}\}$

STEP 3 Step 3: Examine the topics associated with word 2 that you have identified

Use the general-purpose interfaces in the Topic Model Observatory (Dfr-browser, TopicBubbles, and pyLDavis) to examine the topics associated with your work that you have identified. For example, Look at other top words in those topics. (*Remember that in pyLDavis you can adjust the λ lambda metric for relevance of top words to a topic.*) Look quickly at some of the documents most associated with those topics, and read a few of the documents. You can also use the special purpose interfaces in the Topic Model Observatory to see other aspects of the topics. For example, See how topics are associated with particular publication sources or whole sets of such sources See how two topics compare to each other in their relation

to publication sources See whether the topics are part of topic-clusters. As you learn about your word in the context of the topics you have identified, start the running note below by making any observations that bear on your research question or are otherwise of interest.



RUNNING NOTE 1 **Start a running note for Word 2:**

End of Block: EXAMINE THE TOPICS YOU IDENTIFIED FOR WORD 2

Start of Block: EXAMINE RELATED TOPICS FOR WORD 2

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent:** [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
- [TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
 TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}

STEP 4 Step 4. Find and examine topics "related" through their top words to the topics you examined above

(1) First, if any of the topics you previously examined are in clusters with other topics, examine some of those other topics.

(2) Second, examine some topics whose top words are similar to those of one or more of the topics you earlier examined. "Similar" means: Suppose that in a topic you earlier examined the top five words are "cat, dog, horse, cow, chicken." Then find topics whose top five words include **one** or **two** of "cat, dog, horse, cow, chicken." Identify below up to 5 such related topics and try to label them:

	Related topics	
	Topic # (1)	Label (1)

(1)		
(5)		
(6)		
(7)		
(8)		

Page Break

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} **Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent:** \${IDENTIFY

- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
- TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
- \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}



RUNNING NOTE 2 Now examine the related topics you identified above and add anything of interest to your running note:

End of Block: EXAMINE RELATED TOPICS FOR WORD 2

Start of Block: ARE THERE RELATED WORDS?

reminders.block7 \${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} **Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent:** \${IDENTIFY

TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

STEP 5 Step 5: Identify related words.

Having looked at your word, did you notice any related words in the topic model of the following kinds? words that are conceptually related to the keyword you just examined (e.g., terms that you might want to examine to continue investigating your research question) words morphologically related to the keyword you just examined (e.g., "sciences" if your just-examined word was "science") that might be looked at more closely to determine if they should or should not be consolidated in the topic model to be the same word ("token") As due diligence, you may also want to use the *Historical Thesaurus of the Oxford English Dictionary (HTOED)* to look around the taxonomic neighborhood of your word for any obvious related words in the English language that you haven't noticed so far. Looking for such words in your topic model will often lead to the same topics you have already considered, but it may also lead down new avenues of exploration. (The *HTOED* provides a systematic taxonomic and chronological view of words categorized by related meanings. It is accessed through a link on the main *OED* page available through your university library's institutional subscription.)

(a) (b)

Screenshot A: Link to the *HTOED* on the *OED* site.

Screenshot B: example from the *HTOED* (taxonomic neighborhood of the word "value" and synonyms in the historical order they entered the language).

If you find related words of interest, please enter them below:

CONCEPTUALLY RELATED **Conceptually related words:**

- (1) _____
 - (2) _____
 - (3) _____
 - (4) _____
 - (5) _____
-

MORPHOLOGICAL RELATED **Morphologically related words:**

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____
- (4) _____
- (5) _____

End of Block: ARE THERE RELATED WORDS?

Start of Block: SUMMARY OBSERVATIONS

R1 exercise info [\\${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}](#)

R data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: [\\${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#) **Topics of interest in which word 2 is prominent:** [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)
[TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1}](#) [\\${IDENTIFY](#)

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
\${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

Related words you noticed: **Conceptually related words:** \${CONCEPTUALLY
RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry} **Morphologically related**
words: \${MORPHOLOGICL RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry}



STEP 6 Step 6. Summary observation on word 2

Please write a brief summary observation on the word 2 you studied that bears on your research question (or explain why looking at the word does not allow you to advance on the question). Feel free to draw on, revise, or extend your running notes for this purpose.

An “observation” should have two parts: a more-or-less objective description in which you have high confidence; and a thesis, hypothesis, interpretation, or suggestion for which you have less confidence before you study the model more closely but that might bear on your research question.

Page Break



RETURN TO MAIN SURVE To go to the next part of this exercise (comparing your words 1 and 2), please press "Next"

(The following text box simply captures the summary observation you just made so that we can carry it forward to a different part of the survey. Ignore it, unless you want to revise it.)

Five horizontal lines for text entry.

End of Block: SUMMARY OBSERVATIONS

Start of Block: COMPARE OBSERVATIONS ON WORDS 1 AND 2

R1 exercise info \${R1: exercise info/QuestionText}

LAST STEP Last analysis step (comparison).

Below are reminders of your examination of your words 1 and 2, followed by questions that ask you to compare, related, and synthesize.

Rw1 data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 1 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} Topics of interest in which word 1 is prominent: \${IDENTIFY

TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY

TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

Related words you noticed: **Conceptually related words:** \${CONCEPTUALLY
RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry} **Morphologically related**
words: \${MORPHOLOGICL RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry}



Rw1 **Reminder: Your summary observations on Word 1**

Rw2 data you entered

Reminders - Data you entered above:

The word 2 you are examining: \${STEP 1/ChoiceTextEntryValue} **Topics of interest in**
which word 2 is prominent: \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}\${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${IDENTIFY

TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/2/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/3/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/4/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/9/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} \${IDENTIFY
TOPICS%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/10/1} **Related topics with similar top words:**

 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/5/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/6/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/7/1}
 \${STEP 4%231/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1} \${STEP 4%232/ChoiceTextEntryValue/8/1}

Related words you noticed: **Conceptually related words:** \${CONCEPTUALLY
RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry} **Morphologically related**
words: \${MORPHOLOGICL RELATED/ChoiceGroup/AllChoicesTextEntry}



Rw2 data you entered **Reminder: Your summary observations on Word 2**

COMPARE WORDS 1 & 2 Think about the relation between Word 1 and Word 2 and how that relation bears on your research question.

As noted earlier in this exercise, an excellent tool to use in relating two (or more) words in a topic model is TopicBubbles. You might want to augment your exploration of each word individually by looking at them together in TopicBubbles.

Reminder: TopicBubbles allows you to search for which topics two (or more) words are both prominent in. See the screenshot below for instructions (and the *TMO Guide*, [chapter 3](#), section 4.c, for a more detailed explanation).

SUMMARY COMPARISON Compare or reflect on the relation between Word 1 and Word 2

Drawing on your previous notes and observations, write a brief summary observation in which you compare the two keywords you have examined in ways that might advance your research question.

An “observation” should have two parts: a more-or-less objective description in which you have high confidence; and a thesis, hypothesis, interpretation, or suggestion for which you have less confidence before you study the model more closely but that might bear on your research question.

End of Block: COMPARE OBSERVATIONS ON WORDS 1 AND 2

Start of Block: RESEARCH TAKEAWAYS (v. 2, created 23 June 2019; rev. 27 June 2019)



TAKEAWAYS Before you finish: Research Takeaways?

After studying your topic model in this exercise, are there any research takeaways you want to record, store, describe, or log (depending on the nature of the takeaway) to provide key evidence, materials, and data that can be used in writing up a report on your research question

or for future humanities advocacy? For example, a research takeaway can be: Evidence in the form of an important topic(s) or relation between topic(s) and words, documents that you want to describe so that you can find it again; A screenshot of something you found while analyzing your topic model with one of the Topic Model Observatory visualization interfaces;

Citations for or excerpts from key documents associated with a topic (e.g., three newspaper articles you want to use in a report); A text copy of words in a topic ranked by proportional weight; Etc. If you have found such research takeaways, record, store, or describe them as appropriate in your team folder on the WE1S Google team drive. **Reminder:**

The folder for your team ([\\${EXERCISE INFO/ChoiceTextEntryValue/1}](#)) in the WE1S Google team drive is [\\${G DRIVE INFO/ChoiceTextEntryValue}](#)" target="_blank">here. The main "AM Team Working Space" for all the teams in the WE1S Google team drive is [here](#). You may also want quickly to log or make a note about your takeaways in the field below in order to have a record of them associated with this survey. That way, when you read over your survey results, you can remember what you took away and where you stored or annotated it.

P.S. Some of the Topic Model Observatory interfaces may also allow you to use the [Hypothes.is](#) web annotation tool to highlight or annotated them in your browser for private or shared use.



COMPANION Q's? **Companion questions?**

"Companion questions" may be defined as questions that help provide context for the research question you are currently addressing or that are follow-on questions you might want to pursue later. WE1S asks you periodically to consider if companion questions have occurred to you because it's a good way to prevent the kind of "tunnel vision" that research can sometimes create.

This is best explained by way of example. Suppose that your research question concerns the degree and nature of discussion about the "humanities crisis." A tunnel-vision view of the problem would be to consider only discussion of the "humanities crisis." A contextually wider view would consider companion questions such as the following: what is the degree and nature of discussion about *other* kinds of crisis by comparison? For example, in what other contexts

(political, economic, spiritual, etc.) does the word "crisis" tend to appear? Do mentions of "crisis" in all these contexts tend to spike up together, or be concentrated in certain kinds of media or sources? Etc.

Having advanced on your research question using the present module, have any "companion questions" occurred to you? **If so, please set them down here so that they can be remembered for possible future use:**

End of Block: RESEARCH TAKEAWAYS (v. 2, created 23 June 2019; rev. 27 June 2019)

Start of Block: SURVEY END (v.2, created 20 June 2019, rev. 28 June 2019)

CONFIDENCE?

Final consideration -- Confidence assessment

It is possible after conducting an interpretation exercise to conclude that you have either high or low confidence in the results (with confidence descending all the way down to a null result).

Please rank your level of confidence in the results of this interpretation exercise on the following scale:

	Null Result (no confidence) (1)	(4)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)	Valid Result (full confidence) (13)
Confidence level: (1)	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

SUGGESTIONS? Suggestions about this module?

Do you have any suggestions about this module of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol (problems, improvements)?

EMAIL A COPY? Before you conclude this module of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol, do you wish to have a report of your answers emailed to you?

Choose "yes" if you have completed the module successfully as part of an interpretation project. The plain-text, HTML, and PDF copies of your survey should be kept as part of the documentation for answering a research question.

- Yes (4)
- No (5)

Display This Question:

If Before you conclude this module of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol, do you wish to have a report... = Yes



EMAIL ADDRESS Please provide your email address to receive a copy of this survey.

You will receive by email a text transcript of the questions and answers in this survey, plus links to HTML and PDF versions. You should keep these as documentation of your interpretation project. **Caution:** The online HTML and PDF versions linked in the email will expire after 31 days.)

Good practice is to copy the emailed transcript as text into a Google Doc in your team folder (in a subfolder called "Qualtrics survey transcripts") and also to download and store there the PDF version. Name the transcripts in the following format (for example): "Module3a (2019-07-11) -

history (Tarika)" (In this example, "history" has been added because it was the keyword that Module3a was used to explore; and "(Tarika)" was added to identify the specific person completing the survey if ithe whole research team did not do so.)

Caution: The online HTML and PDF versions ilinked in the email you receive will expire after 31 days.

Your email:

END This is the end of the current module of the WE1S Interpretation Protocol.

IMPORTANT: To submit your answers and have Qualtrics mark your survey as completed, please press "Save à Next"

End of Block: SURVEY END (v.2, created 20 June 2019, rev. 28 June 2019)
