

## One narrative that the media promotes is that intrinsic humanistic values lead to jobs, grants, and other tangible outcomes.

Building on our finding that the media assesses the "value" of the humanities in terms both intrinsic and economic (KF 4-1), we find that the media in our Collection 1 also advances a causal narrative linking the two values. The media understands that "intrinsic" humanities values enable the student, university, and/or community to secure "extrinsic" outcomes. In effect, this narrative directly links the humanities' intangible values (such as critical thinking, empathy, and community service) with extrinsic values like marketability, grants, and employment<sup>1</sup>. Rather than view each kind of value as separate, such discourse implies that intrinsic values lead to extrinsic activities (e.g., employment) that have an economically tangible outcome.

Topic 73 illustrates this pattern. Articles highly associated with this topic describe private and public organizations that fund humanities initiatives and research projects. Top words include: community, support, work, education, leadership. Top documents confirm that engaging in community initiatives and other intrinsic activities like critical thinking are eligible for fundable work (e.g., see article a).

Topic 2 exemplifies aligning the intrinsic learning of *skills* with quantifiable outcomes. This topic's documents emphasize that students should develop humanities-associated skills as employment skills (see article b). This topic's top words include: *students*, *learning*, *skills*, *education*. In this discourse, to be an employable student after college means treating values like creativity, analytical thinking, and learning about cultural diversity as economically-oriented labor. Rather than view these

values in and of themselves, the media sees them as *skills*, thus imposing economic imperatives. This observation raises the following question: does the media's tendency to equate the humanities' intangible values with quantifiable, economic results repress the sense of the humanities as having values in their own right?

```
effort
                              build
               impact develop
                               address
               opportunity working strong
   commitment
               communities
                                 initiative
               future opportunities
   needs leadership development organizations
programs mission efforts new education
                                     success
  focus provide role work support goals
  years serve continue
     create issues
                       community
            need
partnership need economic resources access leaders important challenges
   educational initiatives
                              goal
```

View of Topic 73 in Topic Bubbles

```
training
             classroom
                      experience process
         professional
                    learn skills different
   future
         real world
practice
    education students creative
   technology teaching
                        problems curriculum
   ways based need learning
                                   ideas
                               new creativity
                     thinking
   approach focus
                          critical research innovation
development knowledge
          work design traditional
                                      ability
   model
               disciplines develop arts
                                  create developing
understanding
           communication student
                change academic
```

View of Topic 2 in Topic Bubbles

**Document collection studied**: Collection 1: U.S. Top Newspapers, 1989-2019 (articles mentioning humanities)

Topic model of this collection: 250 topics

Sample Topics: 2, 25, 61, 73. Representative articles: a, b.

Evidentiary documentation for this key finding: Team 4

Report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Expressly academic discourse also tends to equate "soft skills" with economic advantages (see <u>KF 8-1</u>).

<sup>9</sup> July 2020; rev. 19 July 2020 (Phillip M. Cortes)